MEN AND MASCULINITIES: A STUDY OF SA'ADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES AND SKETCHES IN *BITTER FRUIT*

SHORT SYNOPSIS

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement of the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

by

LUBNA REHMAN

Registration number: MRUEDDN012K210029

Under the supervision of

Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha

Associate Professor

School of Humanities and Languages, MRU

Department of Education and Humanities

School of Education and Humanities

2023

MEN AND MASCULINITIES: A STUDY OF SA'ADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES AND SKETCHES IN *BITTER FRUIT*

SHORT SYNOPSIS

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement of the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

by

LUBNA REHMAN

Registration number: MRUEDDN012K210029

Under the supervision of

Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha

Associate Professor

School of Humanities and Languages, MRU

Department of Education and Humanities

School of Education and Humanities

2023

MANAV RACHNA
Vidyanatariksha

MANAV RACHNA UNIVERSITY
Declared as State Private University vide Haryana Act 26 of 2014

MANAV RACHNA UNIVERSITY

Sector- 43, Aravali Hills, Faridabad

Date: 11/10/23

DECLARATION BY THE SCHOLAR

I hereby declare that the short synopsis entitled **"MEN AND MASCULINITIES: A STUDY OF SA'ADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES AND SKETCHES IN *BITTER FRUIT*"** being submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Department of Education and Humanities under the School of Education and Humanities of Manav Rachna University, Faridabad during the academic year 2022-2023.

It is the work that is expected to be carried out under the supervision of Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha, Associate Professor, School of Education and Humanities, Manav Rachna University.

Further, it is declared that the short synopsis is within the plagiarism limit and copy of the same is attached as per the University norms.

Lubna Rehman

Registration Number: **MRUEDDN012K210029**

CamScanner

MANAV RACHNA UNIVERSITY

Declared as State Private University vide Haryana Act 26 of 2014

MANAV RACHNA UNIVERSITY

Sector- 43, Aravali Hills, Faridabad

Date: 11.10.2023

CERTIFICATE BY SUPERVISOR(s)

This is to certify that, the short synopsis entitled **"MEN AND MASCULINITIES: A STUDY OF SA'ADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES AND SKETCHES IN *BITTER FRUIT*"** is an original piece of work done by research scholar Lubna Rehman under the supervision of Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the Department of Education and Humanities under the School of Education and Humanities of Manav Rachna University, Faridabad during the academic year 2022-2023.

Further, it is certified that the short synopsis is within the plagiarism limit and copy of the same is attached as per the University norms.

Supervisor

Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha

Associate Professor

Department of Education and Humanities

CamScanner

ABSTRACT

When we talk about Masculinity, we often refer to it in the Singular. Have we pondered over the fact that Masculinity can be of varying kinds, hence, be referred to in the Plural? The pages which follow throw light on the same idea. It is true that Feminism and Femininity has taken the limelight for 'n' number of years now. Also, very ironically and gradually and stealthily, we have side-lined menfolk in the process. Over all these decades, have we not marginalized men? It is time we think about men not just as victors but also as victims, not just as the oppressors but also as the oppressed, and not just as the intimidating, but also as the pressurized. It is the need of the hour that we understand the vulnerability of sexuality in the most traumatic time of our country's past. Highlighting men in all the varied aspects, the thesis will delve into the numerous faces of men. Along with highlighting the vulnerable, the subtle, the docile and the fragile side of men, the thesis aims to break the rigid notions of Masculinity and introduce 'Masculinities' through Sa'adat Hasan Manto. Masculinities in a time where no rigid approach would have been just. Masculinities in the most torturous and excruciatingly painful time in the history of India, The Partition.

Keywords: Masculinity, Feminism, Femininity, Marginalization, Vulnerability, Sexuality

Contents

1. INTRODUCTION 3
2. SCOPE AND OBJECTIVES 4
3. REVIEW OF LITERATURE 6
4. JUSTIFICATION 8
5. MEHTODOLOGY 10
6. TENTATIVE CHAPTER DIVISION 13
7. TENTATIVE CHAPTER NOMENCLATURE 13
8. SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY 16

1. Introduction

In recent decades, the attaining knowledge about men and their masculinities is achieving accolades as an interactive arena of a holistic inquiry. The inquiry can commence from the meaning of masculinity as specified by the critic, 'R. W. Connell' " 'Masculinity'…is simultaneously a place in gender relations, the practices through which men and women engage that place in gender, and the effects of these practices in bodily experience, personality and culture." Hence, masculinity should be understood as masculinities in not just the physical trait but also the political, societal and the psychological traits. The definition given by Connell also tells us that masculinity is not the character-trait of men in specific, and reminds us of being cautious while using the terms 'men', 'male' and 'masculinity' interchangeably. The concept of a person is not in the form of an individual but 'dividual', that is, a divisible and a fluid being in steady interchange with the environment and conceived as channelling heterogeneous and ever-flowing substances. Looking at Indian and/or post-colonial masculinities, one inadvertently also comes across terms such as virility and effeminacy which were introduced during the colonial period. These terms too deal with masculinities and explore how the idea of virility can be detached from men, and how effeminacy can be attached to men. Be it Mrinalini Sinha who talks of Bengali men as considered effeminate, or be it Indira Chawdhury who explains how Bengali men were physically and morally identified as weak; these gendered identifications of a colonised man as womanly underwent various constructions and reconstructions especially in a multi-lingual, multi-ethnic country like India. Hence, diverse masculinities are constituted in relation to other masculinities and femininities through the structural idea of gender relationships and other societal edifices such as caste and class.

Above mentioned ideas and many such western themes when linked to Manto's stories form the basis of the thesis. Some sixty years after partition, we still have people living and recalling the bloodshed and we inevitably still read partition narratives which capture crucial flashes of the human dilemma in the subcontinent. Some through novels, some through plays, some through poems and some through short stories, writers of such narratives have showcased this gruesome reality of partition days in their own creative ways. One among the many creative writers who stands apart is Sa'adat Hasan Manto. Manto said-

> "If you are not familiar with the age in which we live, read my stories. If you cannot endure my stories, it means that this age is unbearable."

Sa'adat Hasan Manto, who was always considered to be much ahead of his times and mostly against the time he was living in, seemed to have tackled masculinity in various ways through not only his own self and personality but through his stories as well. Living in the colonial period, a totally detested life, Manto developed (un)knowingly, interesting ideas on masculinity and showcased various levels of the same in his stories and sketches. Manto was said to have "transgressed" all boundaries of obscenity, but were not the actual happenings of this great division transgressive? Making those moments immortal through a pen was considered obscene, but weren't the tragic events immortal and obscene from the very inception? The most misunderstood and the most loved writer at the same time, Manto's works depicted truth in the truest colours of reality. Looking at masculinities, this is an attempt to understand his stories in a new light.

Manto has always been against almost every ideology and happening of his time. His stories deal with several such ideas he works against, one of which is the conception of masculinity. The concept of masculinity did not develop in his time, but he was so much against anything that is stereotypical, that many of his stories deal with various notions of femininity and masculinity in every appealing way possible, challenging everything that lacked individuality.

To move to another argument, psychological masculinity can be another aspect to look at. The well-known Indian critic 'Sudhir Kakar' characterizes an original and constant attempt to comprehend emotional and enlightening subtleties of maleness in India. While Kakar is a fount of knowledge, his preliminary drill was 'psychotherapy'. His revolutionary study, *The Essentials* (2011) investigations the minute details of regularizing mediums, domestic constructions and socialization procedures which form the male consciousness.

2. Scope and Objective

"…slim, fair, delicate fair hands with veins showing on their back…long neck, thin legs…refined with a touch of femininity."[1] (Chander 31)

This is the description of Sa'adat Hasan Manto. Interestingly, his personality negated the notions of masculinity, so did his habits, so did his stories. The idea of masculinity showcases

[1] Wadhawan, Jagdish Chander. "Manto's Personality" in *Manto Naama: The Life and Works of Sa'adat Hasan Manto.* Jai Ratan, trans. New Delhi: The Lotus Collection, 1998. Print.

Krishen Chander describes Manto very vividly. Interestingly, his personality can question the idea of masculinity. His voice is described in a similar manner- being feminine. P. 31-52

beneficial retort towards the miscellaneous vicissitudes in males' subsists encouraged either by female freedom or through significant shifts in the social order. When one thinks of "gender" and nation, one often thinks of "womenfolk" and homeland. This opens the enthusiasts into interrogations we must decipher as well as discuss: Within a world of hybrid selves, what do people make of machismo.

Usually, one has seen the male Manto characters highlighted in a complete negative light in adherence to their approach towards women. The devilish characters are no doubt seen as devilish, and we see protectors as evil men wearing a mask of goodness. But this is not the only way to depict men. Sexual exploitation is not the only way to see their "maleness" and physical abuse is not the only way to see their domination.

The approach in this paper therefore will be to highlight the still buried or hardly highlighted aspects. Be it the "feminine masculinity" or "masculine femininity." The thesis will aim to question masculinity's rigid and/or flexible definition through their link to the "masculine" characters; thus showing diversity in masculinity and highlighting it in a more nuanced manner.

The likes of such chronicles show perceptible how both the genders are vulnerable to intricate violence along with incapacitating dislodgment. After hundred years of Manto and his stories, interrogation on these aspects will lead one to not only understand Manto's stories better, but will also open-up new horizons for further research.

It is time we collectively think about altering 'men'talities. Hence, the thesis is not an antagonistic response to Females' Educations; instead, being intricately connected aspects of 'Gender Studies', the two procedures of investigation must mature in a discourse-like fashion. Femininity is interrelated to Masculinity and vice-versa because of which it can be believed that as long as women did not have some kind of agency, they were looked upon through the male gaze. Therefore, it is through the trajectory of women that one can understand the framing of Indian Masculinity. It is from the 1860s that women's education had staked its claims as a major issue. It seems that in relation to education, the only difference between girls and boys was women having an upper hand, very ironically.

Be it Rassundari Devi's *My Life* (1876), Savitri Devi Nanda's *The City of Two Gateways: An Autobiography of an Indian Girl* (1950) or Sudha Majumdar's *A Pattern of Life* (1977); be it Laxmibai Tilak, Pandita Ramabai or Ramabai Ranade- They significantly dealt with women and their power, and the powerlessness of men over "adamant" women.

The woman was the centre of the home and the difference between the world and the home became the root dichotomy from which other dichotomies flowed, such as materialism in contrast to spiritualism; and masculinity in contrast to femininity. The masculine materialistic world was dominated by the colonial presence and the feminine spiritual world was seen as free. Unlike the traditional woman, the new woman had new skills and new moral roles. Hence, while women gradually took to exercising "moral leadership", creating social alliances and managing economic resources, men started to take a backseat where their reflection was only as per gendered norms. Even in the traumatic Partition period, Manto's men echo a changed gender identity. The thesis will aim to bring that to the forefront.

3. Review of Literature

Sa'adat Hasan Manto, a controversial and a famous writer of his time has had his works undergo a lot of scrutiny. Be it sexual violence, political violence, mental violence, question of identity and women's lives: all these issues have been tackled at great length. His works have been highly controversial because of his stories showing women and sexuality in explicit manners and highlighting their traumatic marginalities but there is seldom any thought given to the "maleness" of the male characters. It seems that men and the idea of masculinity is ironically marginalized and subverted as far as its representation is concerned. Manto's "Open It" brutally highlights assumptions about the kind of violence most women have faced, says Sarvar Sherry Chand in Open It! Engendering Partition Narratives, but there is no focus on the protagonist's father. While Open It! Clearly showcases patriarchal violence, it also vividly describes patriarchal protectionism, but how much is the latter spoken about? Another very controversial story written by Manto is Cold Meat (*Thanda Gosht)* which brings to light Isvar Singh as the protagonist. A male character who refuses to perform the act of acknowledging the phallus power. By simply negating and/or denying phallus power, he successfully repudiates gendered power relations as well. Consequently, the burden of cognition falls on him. Manto's stories as mentioned in The Journal of Asian Studies have "developed an interest in recovering the past of those marginalized from power." The gap exists here because in showcasing the plight of women or violence, the critics have ironically made those who were in power, powerless, that is, men and their various levels of masculinities. Be it the friendships between a Hindu and a Muslim or be it the land and home, critics have also spoken about the "harmonious past in which lives and cultures, joys and sorrows, were shared in ways that

partition made impossible"[2]. Along with the nostalgia of the past and the infliction of sorrows on women, it will be interesting to focus on the nostalgia of men and the sorrows or joys specifically on their mind. In Toba Tek Singh we look at madmen and the sanity behind their insanity, but we never ponder over the fact that this story has minor female characters and that the "insane" men here negate masculinity not just literally but also psychologically. Another example can be Mozel where the "manly" character is a woman and how the Sikh man gives up on one of his masculine traits (his beard) for a woman. Manto's sketches such as Mistake Removed, The Fool and Determination also speak of men and masculinity. Where Mistake Removed speaks of how men castrate men off their masculinity, The Fool speaks of how a man's beard is as sacred as his religion and Determination mentions how a man is determined to not become a Sikh and wants his razor back to free himself from the physical masculine trait. One may argue that the picture of men as portrayed in partition narratives is mostly a shade of pure black. The thesis will argue that it can be otherwise too. If there is mercilessness by men imposed on women there is also helplessness that men are inflicted with. If there is domination by men, we can also see command by women. If there is dependency of women over men, we see the vice-versa situation as well. If there are women in positive light, there are brave men in positive light too. On the other hand, we also see masculine women and feminine men and dependent and coward men and strong brave women in many of his works.

Going against yet another aspect of inability of expression of violence, Sa'adat Hasan Manto has expressed precisely that in his stories and sketches. He went much beyond the empirical reality and beyond treaties and wars and probed the 'silent chaos' and a 'hushed noise' of the human mind. Manto went beyond the 'seen' and the observable, and approached questions of ontological subsistence, of belonging, of relating to others, of guilt and repentance, of the need to go back in time in order to live and yet the impossibility of going back. Thus, Manto's works march forth to tackle the realities that were "unnarratable" or impossible to sympathise with, empathize with, or ponder over. His works successfully focus on individual lives (even if they remain nameless and faceless) and their effort to create some sort of meaning out of their meaninglessness and the futility of the world around them. Thus, his works bring into focus the human agency and dialogues with the notion of guilt, remorse, meaninglessness, insignificance, barbarity and helplessness. One now needs to explore this gory rush in the

[2] As said by Gayendra Pandey in Community and Violence Recalling Partition.

context of male characters and their various shades of masculinity- some shades exposed, while some shades, shady.

4. Justification

Focusing, on yet another aspect the thesis will be looking at masculinities in Manto's short stories and sketches. As known, his works have been depicted, appreciated and critiqued a lot many times on various aspects such as women's sexuality, women's psychic stability or instability, the traumas of partition, etc. But seldom, critics throw light on the "maleness" of the male characters. Looking at this rarely touched idea, one can explore Manto's works and the partition time all over again. The gulf exists only due to the fact that less has been said about the male characters and less have the critics moved away from the cliché, stereotypical ideas formed of men in connection to women, or in relation to a tiresome time. In an attempt to cover this gulf, the thesis will focus not on women but male characters, not on violence outside or within the women's mind but vehemence within men, and not just the already known notions of men but a totally different perspective. The focus will be on masculinity theories and on not just bravery but helplessness, not just rioters or disguised protectors but protectors in the true meaning of the word, not just sinners but the innocents, not just sexually explicit characters but also the morally correct ones and not just victors but also victims, further highlighting the complexity. Only when one looks closely into Manto's pieces will one be able to realise and analyse how he associated all these elements and traits to his male characters as well.

The period of partition has been one such event, the shame of which has outlived the loss of lives and values. In such a cataclysmic and claustrophobic event where everything seemed erratic, it would have furthermore been an ignominy to have been stuck to the cliché notions. Manto, hence, chose otherwise. Manto's stories and sketches, beginning with a piece of reality, ranged from an encounter between a man and a woman, to a clash between the two communities. Manto moved away to the level of "artistic correctness" where he created a world of his own, a world in which, through the creation of individual characters- imaginary, real or both- he investigated the social being of man, the role of certain sections of the society in history, the conflicts of their interests and the nature of their clashes and cleavages. It is through the interpretation of the "manly" world that Manto gave a picture of the mental make-up of the people, their morals, dieas and aspirations. It is with this very intention that Manto created a Babu Gopinath, a Kalwant Kaur, a Bhishan Singh, a Saugandhi, a Khalid, a Ghatin girl, an

Isvar Singh, a nameless father, and many such characters. Through each of these characters, Manto distilled links not only amid literature and society, but also wanted to spurn the deeply embedded age-old notions of masculinity and femininity. It is because of this uniqueness in Manto's works that his insights are much more bracing, poignant and more hard hitting. It may be interesting to observe here that there is perhaps no more significant piece of writing on partition than Manto's universally renowned stories. Also, his sketches, which are very brief anecdote like pieces on partition are not only unique but also insightful.

Brevity, said Shakespeare, is the soul of wit. Manto appears to have perfected this art of succinctness and so the art of wit is the writing of his short pieces pertaining to partition. Some of these are as brief as being two liners. These show Manto's prowess of both constructing a story and a message, his architectonics as well as his aesthetics. There is a small anecdote titled The Garland (popularly known as "Joota") wherein Manto shows a crowd of rioters turning its violent insanity from humans to icons and vandalizing a statue of Sir Ganga Ram who was a well-known philanthropist and a public person who had set up a hospital. The crowd attacked it with rods and pelted stones. Someone blackened the face with coal tar and someone collected old shoes from the vicinity, strung them together in the form of a garland to put them around the neck of the statue. In South Asia, such an act tantamounts to inflicting extreme public humiliation. It is only when the police intervened that the humiliation was prevented and "the person who was to garland the statue with shoes got injured. Thus, he was sent to Sir Ganga Ram hospital for treatment."

Not only does this snippet lack the presence of a woman character, the readers also notice how the same gender is each other's enemy. Along with the several bonds of pain and suffering and success that women share with each other, one of the strongest is that of unity through thick and thin; though one cannot say the same about men and masculinities. This snippet shows how everyone in that catastrophic time was each other's foe, hence, lacking in accord. Also, Manto, never leaving his sarcastic streak highlights the same in his punch line with which he ends the story. The statue around whose neck the protagonist wanted to put the garland of shoes was the same person in whose hospital he got admitted and treated. In one point of time, where the man was seen in power in front of the helpless statue, the very next moment makes us observe the vice-versa situation. The title "Joota" is the anecdote which actually applies to the rioters who were vandalising the statue of Sir Ganga Ram by beating it with shoes, than to the personality of the philanthropist whose hospital treats both Hindus and Muslims alike.

Manto, through various such pieces has made readers rethink on designs of power and superiority which could not be restricted to a specific set of people or gender. With sketches of numbered lines, he proves precisely how. Men and masculinity are always considered synonymous to power, prestige, and superiority. But Manto demonstrates otherwise. He rather shows how transient and feeble such philosophies are and how hastily and swiftly the unyielding equations changed then, and can vary now. Various other sketches such as Munasib Karyavaahi (Appropriate Action), Islah (Identity), Ulahna (Double Cross), Peshbandi (Deployment), etc. prove the same.

5. Methodology

"Boys will be boys". "All men are like that". We cannot get further from reality. We can witness abundant evidence that all males vary widely and masculinities are manifold. The dissertation will contain research with relevant materials drawn from the theory of gender studies which use the concept of gender to analyse a wide range of disciplines. Although many appearances of reasoning in gender analysis are enthused by feminism, a major variety of theoretical slants are used to study the categories of gender studies which include heterosexual studies, women's studies, men's studies, and homosexual studies. Keeping gender education and men in mind, it is easy to conclude that excluding some exceptions, men are infrequently obviously mentioned in gender strategy credentials. Where men are considered, they are generally seen as obstacles to women. Beyond this, there is scarceness of literature which enlightens notions of gender relations that include a focus on men and masculinities. This might further help the enthusiasts in understanding the lives and livelihoods of both the genders concerned, in a much-improved way.

Sa'adat Hasan Manto was always at loggerheads with the political and social norms. The one chief difference between his stories and sketches is the space he gave to women characters. Manto's stories deal with a lot of women and he proves the lack of manliness in men through these very powerful and opinionated women. Albeit, Manto in the stories complicates the theory of masculinity through women, he does exactly the opposite in his sketches proving that the weaknesses and insecurities in men are not just restricted to one sphere but many. There is hardly any woman in any of his sketches, and even if there is, she is ignorable. Manto's sketches are a man's world, dealing wholly with men and their weak, timid, superficial, and self-doubting masculinities. Manto, through this plethora of difference in the two genres he wrote, only stresses how complicated masculinity can be. How there can also be a boy or a man as

naive and unmindful, as there can be men equally clever. How there can also be a man as helpless, as there can be a man as powerful. How there can be a man as horrified, as there can be men with misplaced assurances. How there can also be a man as dejected, as there can be men appallingly pleased. How there can be men devoted to God and the goodness associated with divinity, and how there are men who are only hypocrites under the name of religious conviction. Consequently, men are many, and so are masculinities. Be it any which way, Manto has showcased the truthfulness of not just the era he lived in, but also the psyche he observed in people.

Many critics have regarded him to be a purely creative writer free from any political or social prejudices and even moral convictions. This is how Muhammad Hassan Askari evaluates Manto's works-

> "Manto did through his stories what an honest and true litterateur ought to have done while writing in those circumstances and so immediately after the events. He put the question of good or bad beyond the pale of controversy. His point of view is neither political, nor social, nor even moral, but literal and creative. Manto only tried to see as to what is the relationship between acts of cruelty from the different points of view of the perpetrator and the victim of cruelty."[3]

One of the few sketches that have a voiceless woman character is "Out of Consideration"

> "'Don't kill my daughter in front of my eyes.'
> 'All right, all right. Peel off her clothes and shoo her aside!'" (Hasan 162)

The entire snippet in two lines sums up a lot of concepts. Manto here does not just highlight the plight of a woman, but also exposes the condition of a helpless father. We can assume that this piece begins with the powerless voice of the father because had there been a mother begging for her daughter's life, she too would not have been spared by the rebels. The father here is shown to be as vulnerable as the abused girl. This only makes the father's condition as vulnerable as the girl, thus bruising his manliness- a trait of which he is least bothered and apparently not even informed.

Colonial discourses on masculinity while irrefutably powerful are not highlighted greatly. Female sexuality on the other hand has experienced a lot of attention. Manto in his works draws

[3] Narang, Harish. "Weaving Black Borders: Manto and the Politics of Partition" in Jasbir, Jain, ed. *Reading Partition: Living Partition.* New Delhi: Rawat, 2007. Print. P. 67.

our attention to the millions of little tragedies- regarding men as well as women- that together composed the whole tragedy of partition. The focus hints should not be on religion or gender masculinity or femininity only; but on the intensity of the drama in general. Manto through his stories and sketches chooses not to talk in favour of any religion or gender. Being a Muslim, he did not hesitate in speaking against his own community whenever need be; and being a man he chose to speak against men and masculinities on various occasions. On diverse circumstances, Manto has succeeded in completely shunning away the beliefs of masculinity and the masculine rules that the society then followed or was supposed to follow. Instead of abiding by the truism related to manliness and masculine rules, or femininity and the general known plight of women, his focus is to care about all the victims- victims who can also be men and not just women. It is only by caring, by empathizing with them that we can learn to overcome our prejudices, and it is only through a wider thought process that one can come out of the minute shell of age-old sayings. Also, it is only through reading these stories and sketches that we can transcend our political biases- which are the most radical stage of political development.

Living up to no Canon of the society Manto lived in, he had to face inspection and analysis, largely in the form of scrutiny. However, Manto never changed his ways of dealing with the society which he reflected finely in his stories and sketches. Rebutting charges of voyeurism and sacrilege Manto said:

> "I'm no sensationalist. Why would I want to take the clothes off a society, civilization and culture that is, in any case, already naked? Yes, it is true I make no attempt to dress it- because it is not my job; that is a dressmaker's job. People say I write with a black pen, but I never write on a blackboard with a black chalk. I always write with a white chalk so that the blackness of the board is clearly visible."[4]

This is exactly what he does, story after story.

Some appealing ideas the thesis will deal with are:

i. Freud's views on the nature and causes of "masculine" and "feminine" traits where his idea of "penis envy" will be allied with the idea of castration in Manto.
ii. Contradicting Aristotle's views on masculinity through Manto's stories.
iii. K.M Bennet's "Theories on masculinity" where he highlights various other critics who talk of masculinity. The theories hold notions which can interestingly be supported or disagreed upon through Manto's works.

[4] Jalil, Rakshanda. "Was Manto a Progressive?" *The Friday Times* May 11-17 2012. https://www.thefridaytimes.com/beta3/tft/article.php?issue=20120511&page=28

iv. Highlighting some well-known feminist writers and conjecture their extreme notions with Manto's help.

v. Relating Manto and C.G Jung's theory of Anima and Animus.

vi. Hegemonic masculinity. Hegemonic masculinity?

vii. Indian masculinity, psychological masculinity and post-colonial masculinity through works by Mrinalini Sinha, Indira Chawdhury, Sudhir Kakkar, Kavita Daiya and Ashis Nandy who not only focus on the plight of women but also look at the social presentation of vehemence grieved by the masculine figures. Thus, withdrawing the rigid notion of masculine masculinity or hegemonic masculinity and showcasing "suffering masculinity".

viii. Extending the above point, the paper will also question the western masculinity theory itself and how appropriate or not appropriate it is in the Indian or Partition context.

6. <u>Tentative Chapter Division (An Overview)</u>

i. The first chapter will be the introductory chapter which will lay the basis for the thesis.

ii. The background will be set in this chapter and a brief introduction to the subsequent chapters will follow, after which the next four to six chapters will look at various theories through Manto's stories and vice-versa.

iii. One of these chapters will include more of psychology than the material things outside, will introduce the notion of "penis envy" followed by interesting explanations of how Manto, in his stories suggests how castration played a main role- Castration of men, by men.

iv. The paper will deal with the philosophy by the Greek philosopher Aristotle and will both support and contradict his concept of women and femininity, and men and masculinity.

v. One may conclude that what we deal with is not masculinity but masculinities. These multiple perceptions will be highlighted further through selected partition stories and sketches.

7. <u>Tentative Chapter Nomenclature</u>

i. ***Masculinity v/s Manto: An Introduction*** – The theory of Masculinity, rather Masculinities, will be explained and examples of the same will be elucidated through Manto's personal life, his basic behavioral propensities, his professional lifespan, and his heroes. This chapter will concentrate on both the theory and the writer.

ii. ***Indian Hegemonic Masculinity? Preparing to Ponder*** – The subdivision will necessitate a re-thinking of certain rigid characterizations and theories which a human mind has carried for ages and generations. The section will make its readers put their thinking caps on, and understand the elasticity and fragility of the very term 'Masculinity.' Hence, preparing to ponder.

iii. ***Philosophizing Philosophies*** – This segment will emphasize on putting forth various theories on Masculinities which several renowned critics have brought forward, and either make them undergo scrutiny or be in sync with them. These theories indeed deny and defy rigid sexualities, and invite the idea of 'Dual Belongingness' or 'Multiple Individualities' or 'Hybrid Identities.' Hence, the complexities will be focused upon through detailed evidences from Manto's stories and sketches.

iv. ***Manto's Time, Manto's Men, Manto's Reflection*** – Manto indeed led us from oblivion to light. The time he was born in was a time not many will be able to understand, only some will be able to relate to, a handful will be able to sympathize with, and probably none who can empathize with it. However, irrespective of the viciousness of that wearisome time, Manto has successfully highlighted the life and plight and the gruesome authenticity of common people, their insecurities, their vulnerabilities, their effeminacies and their virilities. This chapter will aim to connect Manto with his time and heroes. Indeed, the readers will perceive a profound connotation.

v. ***Manto: The Case Rested*** – Several of Sa'adat Hasan Manto's charged stories will be brought to light. The reasons to their 'charge', and also how they "changed and charged" the human minds. This will be then led to a subtle conclusion to Manto's life and the light he offered to the world.

I would then like to conclude from where I will begin the thesis, that is, the writer himself, Sa'adat Hasan Manto. Manto seems to have framed the trajectory from the personal to the public because not only do his short stories depict various levels of masculinity, his personality too did the same and eschewed the cliché ideas of masculine role. As much brutal as he was in the depiction of men and their masculinity through sexual explicitness, he himself was the total opposite of it. He had a slim built with thin, fair, and delicate limbs (much like women's). They were beautiful to the extent that Ismat Chugtai, his contemporary, was envious of the tenderness of his delicate lady-like feet. He rebelled against the society through his own unmanly

character traits as well. His personality showed the spiritual and platonic love embedded in him for the only shepherdess woman he fell in love with. Ironically and interestingly enough, she was a woman described as having a broad chest, round and fleshy arms, and manly broad shoulders. It is appealing to analyse the "manly woman" and the "womanly man" not just because of their appearances but also because of the following fascinating incident.

A conversation between Manto and Ismat Chugtai initiated by the latter is as follows:

"What kind of love is this? Slippery like an eel./ I was expecting something different from you. Some sizzling flaming affair./ So you came away with a piece of candy? How brave of you!"/ "I don't go in for slovenly love" protested Manto./ "I call it third rate, spineless love."/ "What did you expect of me? Sleep with her?"/ "Leave a bastard puppy behind as a token of my manhood?"[5]
(Wadhawan 51-52)

A complicated personality and a blend of absolute opposites, Manto as well as many characters in his stories seem to be polygender or ambigender. One can easily complicate the very inflexible yet effortless sounding definition of terms such as ambiguous gender polygender or androgyny. These terms include, rather segregate people who fall neither under the category of men nor women because they are a bit of both. Is it just the physical appearance that decides who will fall under these terms? It is indeed debatable. The debate shall continue...

[5] Wadhawan, Jagdish Chander. "Manto's Personality" *Manto Naama: The Life and Works of Sa'adat Hasan Manto.* Jai Ratan, trans. New Delhi: The Lotus Collection, 1998. Print. P. 31-52.

8. Select Bibliography (References)

Primary source:

1. Hasan, Khalid. *Bitter Fruit: The Very Best of Saadat Hasan Manto.* New Delhi: Penguin Books, 2008. Print.

Secondary sources:

2. Asaduddin, M. *black margins: Sa'adat Hasan Manto Stories*. Memon Umar, Mohammad. ed. New Delhi: Katha and Oxford UP, 2001. Print.
3. Bennet, K.M. "Journal of Ageing Studies". Jaber E. Gubrium. ed. Vol.21, No.4. Columbia: Elsevier journal, 2007. 347-356. Google Scholar Search. Web. 21 Oct 2012. Print. http://www.liv.ac.uk/~kmb/MyPublishedPapers/Bennett2007.pdf
4. Bhalla, Alok. ed. *Life and Works of Saadat Hasan Manto*. New Delhi: Replica Press Pvt. Ltd., 1997. Print.
5. Chatterjee, Suprateek. "A Crises of Indian Masculinity". Hindustan Times July 22 2012. Print.
6. Connel, R.W. "Masculinities: Clinical Knowledge- Psychoanalysis and Masculinity". אני, 2011. 1-1. Google Search. Web. 21 Oct 2012. http://culturalstudiesnow.blogspot.in/2011/07/rw-connell- masculinities-clinical.html
7. Daiya, Kavita. *Violent Belongings: Partition, Gender and National Culture in Post Colonial India.* New Delhi: Yoda Press, 2013. Print.
8. Flanagan J, Owen. "Freud: Masculinity, Femininity, and the Philosophy of Mind". 60-76. Google Search. Web. 21 Oct 2012. Print. http://www.duke.edu/~ojf/FreudOnMasculinityandFemininity.pdf
9. Flemming, Leslie. *Another Lonely Voice: The Life of Saadat Hasan Manto*. Pakistan: Allied Press, 1985. Print.
10. Gardiner, Judith. "Men, Masculinities and Feminist Theories". 2004. 35-50. Google Search. Web. 2012. Print. http://www.corwin.com/upm-data/5177_Kimmel_Chapter_3.pdf
11. Hasan, Khalid. *Mottled Dawn: Fifty Sketches and Stories of Partition.* New Delhi: Penguin Books, 2011. Print.
12. Hasan, Mushirul. "Memories of a Fragmented Nation: Rewriting the Histories of India's Partition". Vol.33, No.41. Economic and Political Weekly, 1998. 2662-2668. JSTOR.Web. 3 Oct 2012 http://www.jstor.org/stable/4407270

13. Ispahani, Mehnaz. “Sa’adat Hasan Manto”. Grand Street Vol.7, No.4. Ben Sonnenberg, 1988. 183-193. JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct 2012. http://www.jstor.org/stable/25007150
14. Jalil, Rakshanda. trans. *Naked Voices: Stories and Sketches Sa’adat Hasan Manto*. New Delhi: Roli Books Pvt. Ltd., 2008. Print.
15. Joshi, Shashi. “The World of Sa’adat Hasan Manto”. n.p. n.p. n.pag. Google Scholar Search. Web. 20 Sept 2012. PDF.
16. Kakkar, Sudhir. *The Essential*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 2011. Print.
17. Koves, Margit. “Telling Stories of Partition and War: Sa’adat Hasan Manto and Istvan Orkeny. Vol.32, No.33/34. Economic and Political Weekly,1997. 2147-2153. JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct 2012. http://www.jstor.org/stable/4405763
18. Kumar, Sukrita. Siddique, Mohammad. eds. *Mapping Memories: Urdu Stories from India and Pakistan*. New Delhi: Katha, 2012. Print.
19. Mittapalli, Rajeswari. Alterno, Letizia. eds. *Post Colonial Indian Fiction in English and Masculinity*. New Delhi: Atlantic Publishers and Distributors (P) Ltd., 2009. Print.
20. Pandey, Gayendra. “Community and Violence: Recalling Partition”. Vol.32, No.32. Econnomic and Political Weekly, 1997. 2037-2045. JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct 2012 http://www.jstor.org/stable/4405734
21. Satinover, Jeffery. “The True Masculine and the True Feminine”. MI. Baker Book House, Grand Rapids, 1995. n.pag. Google Search. Web. 21 Oct 2012. http://www.leannepayne.org/jung/CrisisInMasculinityAppendix.pdf
22. Sherry Chand, Sarvar. “Manto’s “Open It”: Engendering Partition Narratives”. Vol.41, No.4. Economic and Political Weekly, 2006. 308-310. JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct 2012. http://www.jstor.org/stable/4417725
23. Tablot, Ian. “The Parting of Ways”. 2vols. Settar, S. Gupta, Indra. eds. n.pag. JSTOR. Web. 3 Oct 2012 http://www.jstor.org/stable/3591823
24. Wadhawan, Jagdish Chander. *Maanto Naama. The Life of Saadat Hasan Manto*. Jai Ratan. Trans. New Delhi: Pritha Offsets Pvt. Ltd., 1998. Print.

MEN AND MASCULINITIES: A STUDY OF SA'ADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES AND SKETCHES IN *BITTER FRUIT*

by Lubna Rehman

Submission date: 10-Feb-2023 09:36PM (UTC+0530)

Submission ID: 2010957343

File name: Saadat_Hasan_Manto_s_Short_Stories_and_Sketches_in_Bitter_Fruit.docx (97.03K)

Word count: 6124

Character count: 32143

MANAV RACHNA
Vidyanatariksha

Swami Vivekananda Library and Resource Centre
Manav Rachna University

SIMILARITY VERIFICATION CERTIFICATE

Title: Men and Masculinities: A Study of Sa'adat Hasan Manto's Short Stories and Sketches in Bitter Fruit

Researcher: Lubna Rehman Registration Number: MRUEDDN012K211

Supervisor: Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha Department: Education & Humanities

This is to certify that the above mentioned Short Synopsis/Thesis was scanned for similarity index through Turnitin Software on 26:09:2023 with submission ID 2177328703 and the similarity index was found to be 8 %. The complete report running into 21 Pages, 6114 Word count with File Size 86.63 KB is being forwarded to the Research Supervisor/DRC/DRB for review.

Swami Vivekananda Library and Resource Centre Faridabad
26/9/2023

Date: 26.09.2023

The complete report of the above Short Synopsis/Thesis has been reviewed and the similarity index is below the accepted norms as per the University Grants Commission (Promotion of Academic Integrity and Prevention of Plagiarism in Higher Educational Institutions) Regulations 2018. The Short Synopsis/Thesis may be considered for further processing

Research Scholar

Chhavi 26.9.2023
Research Supervisor

CamScanner

MEN AND MASCULINITIES: A STUDY OF SA'ADAT HASAN MANTO'S SHORT STORIES AND SKETCHES IN *BITTER FRUIT*

SHORT SYNOPSIS

By

LUBNA REHMAN

Registration No.: MRUEDDN012K210029

Under the supervision of

Dr. Chhavi Kulshreshtha

Associate Professor

Department of Education and Humanities

School of Education and Humanities

MANAV RACHNA UNIVERSITY

Sector-13, Aravali Hills, Faridabad

Year 2023

ABSTRACT

When we talk about Masculinity, we often refer to it in the Singular. Have we pondered over the fact that Masculinity can be of varying kinds, hence, be referred to in the Plural? The pages which follow throw light on the same idea. It is true that Feminism and Femininity has taken the limelight for 'n' number of years now. Also, very ironically and gradually and stealthily, we have side-lined menfolk in the process. Over all these decades, have we not marginalized men? It is time we think about men not just as victors but also as victims, not just as the oppressors but also as the oppressed, and not just as the intimidating, but also as the pressurized. It is the need of the hour that we understand the vulnerability of sexuality in the most traumatic time of our country's past. Highlighting men in all the varied aspects, the thesis will delve into the numerous faces of men. Along with highlighting the vulnerable, the subtle, the docile and the fragile side of men, the thesis aims to break the rigid notions of Masculinity and introduce 'Masculinities' through Sa'adat Hasan Manto. Masculinities in a time where no rigid approach would have been just. Masculinities in the most torturous and excruciatingly painful time in the history of India, The Partition.

Keywords: Masculinity, Feminism, Femininity, Marginalization, Vulnerability, Sexuality

Lubna_Rehman_Short_Synopsis_29.09.2023.docx

ORIGINALITY REPORT

Excluding matches less than 14 words

8%	6%	3%	4%
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	www.exoticindiaart.com Internet Source	2%
2	Barbara Daly Metcalf. "An Introduction to the Bihishti Zewar", University of California Press, 1990 Publication	1%
3	shodhgangotri.inflibnet.ac.in Internet Source	1%
4	etd.lib.metu.edu.tr Internet Source	1%
5	www.goodreads.com Internet Source	1%
6	ir.amu.ac.in Internet Source	1%
7	Submitted to The University of the South Pacific Student Paper	<1%
8	www.thenewleam.com Internet Source	<1%

CamScanner

9	etd.uum.edu.my Internet Source	<1%
10	www.essaysauce.com Internet Source	<1%
11	Submitted to School of Oriental & African Studies Student Paper	<1%
12	Submitted to American Public University System Student Paper	<1%
13	Submitted to Higher Education Commission Pakistan Student Paper	<1%
14	kar.kent.ac.uk Internet Source	<1%

Exclude quotes Off
Exclude bibliography On

Exclude matches < 14 words

CamScanner